

## Scott Johnson

---

**From:** Working Animal Advocates <workinganimaladvocates@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, January 31, 2014 11:34 AM  
**To:** Scott Johnson  
**Subject:** Comments Re Entertainment and Sports Center Draft EIR  
**Attachments:** horse-drawn-carriage-accidents.pdf; 8.20.2013 HC ltr to Mayor Johnson.pdf; chac-Philadelphia Bar Institute 8-10-3.pdf; Letter to Liz Brenner - 11.28.12.pdf

Dear Mr. Johnson and Members of the Planning and Design Commission,

We are writing today as a group of citizens concerned with the Proposed Project's potential adverse impacts on the horses used to pull carriages in and around the City's Old Town Historic District.

At present, horse-drawn carriage rides are offered on routes in Old Sacramento and on routes outside Old Sacramento in the area of the proposed Arena. The Draft EIR fails to consider the potential impacts that increases in vehicle, bike and pedestrian traffic resulting from the construction and use of the proposed Arena will have on the occurrence and severity of accidents involving horse-drawn carriages operating in and around Old Sacramento. As documented in the attached information, horse-drawn carriages that operate in urban environments and share busy streets with motorized vehicles, bicycles and pedestrians can be a cause of serious accidents that result in grave injury, or even death, to the horses and members of the public. The Proposed Project will increase all three types of traffic and, therefore, likely cause significant risks to the safety and well-being of the horses and public.

Further, the Draft EIR fails to consider the impact of increased noise and vehicle pollution on the carriage horses in the area of the Arena as a result of its construction and use. Again, as documented in the attached information, noise and vehicle pollution potentially creates a significant adverse impact on the health and welfare of horses used to pull carriages in urban settings. The construction and use of the Arena will introduce increased levels of urban noise and vehicle pollution in the immediate vicinity of horses pulling carriages in the streets around the Arena. Because carriage horses operate in a nose-to-tailpipe setting, any increase in surface street traffic will increase the horses' exposure to vehicle noise and pollution emissions. Additionally, horses being "spooked" by loud or startling noises is a primary cause of accidents involving horse-drawn carriages.

Finally, we believe the significant adverse impacts posed by the construction and use of the Arena require consideration of the mitigation measures of (i) the elimination of horse-drawn carriage routes in the affected area of the Proposed Project during its construction and (ii) the banning of horse-drawn carriage operations on streets in the area of increased traffic during times the Arena is in use.

Thank you in advance for your consideration of, and response to, these comments.

Sincerely,

Kim Flaherty

Working Animal Advocates

<http://www.workinganimal.org/>

# Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

The following is a partial list of incidents involving horses used in carriage operations. Contact PETA for documentation.

**December 28, 2013/San Antonio, Texas:** A car hit a carriage, knocking the driver out of the rig. The car then fled the scene.

**December 21, 2013/St. Louis, Missouri:** A horse named King keeled over and died while pulling a carriage in a holiday light display.

**December 12, 2013/Louisville, Kentucky:**

A car rear-ended a carriage that was being operated by the Louisville Horse Trams company, causing the horse to break free and take off down the street.

**November 10, 2013/Galveston, Texas:** The driver of a carriage jumped out of the rig after the horse took off running, leaving two passengers behind. The driver was run over by the carriage, and one passenger jumped out as the other tried to regain control. The carriage plowed through a fence.

**November 9, 2013/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** A horse named Silver, who was pulling a carriage for the 76 Carriage Co., slipped and fell and was unable to get up. He was then strapped to a tractor and raised to his feet.

**June 10, 2010/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** A pit bull slipped out of her leash and attacked a horse pulling a carriage.

**April 10, 2010/Anchorage, Alaska:** A drunk driver crashed her pickup truck into a horse-drawn carriage.



**September 26, 2013/New York City, New York:** A horse named Chris sustained scratches after he bolted through midtown, sideswiped a car, and flipped the carriage. Chris was pinned under the overturned carriage and was freed after a group of bystanders lifted the rig off his hind legs. The driver, Frank Luo, owner of the Manhattan Carriage Co., had been charged just the previous day for operating a carriage for more than 12 hours in a 20-hour period and for overcharging riders. Luo admitted that Chris had been acting strangely as soon as they left the stable, yet Luo continued on his way.

**August 17, 2013/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse named Jerry collapsed on State Street in downtown Salt Lake City in sweltering heat while pulling a carriage. He sustained cuts and abrasions when he fell on the hot asphalt. Straps were tied to him so that he could be dragged into a trailer. Back at the stable, a tractor was used to lift his limp body into a barn. Jerry subsequently died.

**July 9, 2013/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A 2-year-old child was thrown from a carriage onto the street near Temple Square. After she landed on the street, a carriage wheel ran over her leg. She was transported to Primary Children's Medical Center with road rash and abrasions.

**April 4, 2013/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse became spooked on North Temple wads of paper at him. The horse bucked and tipped the carriage over into a Utah Transit Authority bus, obstructing traffic for about an hour.

**August 10, 2013/Petaluma, California:** An 11-year-old girl riding in a horse-drawn carriage was injured after the horse was spooked and took off running full speed down the street. The driver was ejected and dragged for several yards, and the girl sustained minor and moderate injuries and was taken to the hospital. The horse was caught and reportedly sustained minor injuries.

**February 2, 2013/Ashfield, Ontario:** A car collided with a carriage, sending two passengers to the hospital.

**January 13, 2013/Scottsdale, Arizona:** Three passengers were taken to the hospital after a carriage hit a curb and flipped over. In a separate incident four days earlier, a horse and carriage plunged into a canal after the horse got spooked.

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

**January 5, 2013/Burbank, California:** A woman sustained head injuries after being ejected from the carriage in which she was riding. The horse pulling the carriage had gotten spooked, causing the carriage to overturn.



**December 21, 2012/Denver, Colorado:** A carriage unexpectedly cracked and splintered in half during a holiday ride, leaving passengers stranded in the carriage.

**December 8, 2012/Guelph, Ontario:** A driver sustained serious injuries after being dragged by two horses who got spooked after the brakes on a nearby car squeaked. The carriage flipped over.

**December 5, 2012/Bethlehem, Pennsylvania:** A witness reported seeing two horses on the side of the road, one lying on the ground and another rearing and bucking. Police said one horse slipped and fell.

**December 3, 2012/North Vernon, Indiana:** A woman died of injuries that she sustained in a carriage accident on November 18. The two horses had gotten spooked and took off, overturning the carriage.

**November 28, 2012/Natchez, Mississippi:** A carriage driver sustained bumps and bruises after a car rear-ended the carriage and he was knocked off it.

**November 25, 2012/Bedford, Pennsylvania:** Two horses who got spooked by band music took off, causing the driver to jump out of the carriage. He was flown by helicopter to the hospital and treated for head injuries. Two passengers were also taken to the hospital with minor injuries.

**November 12, 2012/New York, New York:** A horse named Henry, who was pulling a carriage in Central Park, hurt his leg after stumbling. He was pulled from service.

**October 28, 2012/Montréal, Québec:** A horse pulling a carriage collapsed, and witnesses reported that the driver kicked him while he was on the ground. The carriage operator surrendered the horse, along with another horse he no longer wanted, to the SPCA.

**September 22, 2012/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse-drawn carriage was struck in the rear by a motor vehicle near 200 South and State Street. The driver fled the scene, but police tracked him down and charged him with a hit-and-run. No injuries were reported.

**September 1, 2012/Houston, Texas:** Two people were sent to the hospital after a car crashed into a carriage.

**August 16, 2012/New York, New York:** A spooked horse took off into busy traffic, dumped the driver and two passengers, struck two cars, split the carriage in two, and ran for four blocks before being captured. The two passengers and the driver were treated for minor injuries. The horse, named Oreo, was tranquilized before being taken back to the stables.

**July 21, 2012/Galveston, Texas:** A man was killed and three others were hospitalized after the carriage in which they were riding was hit by a car. The horse's leg was cut open, according to an eyewitness, and the animal was led away limping.

**July 13, 2012/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** A horse named Dutch, who was pulling a carriage, became startled and ran into an intersection, where two cars hit the carriage. The driver was thrown from the carriage and hospitalized. The horse took off down the street and sustained a leg injury.

**July 10, 2012/Casper, Wyoming:** Two horses were euthanized and three people sustained injuries when an SUV rear-ended a carriage. A witness said that the carriage and horses were thrown into the air.

**June 7, 2012/New York, New York:** A horse sustained a "nasty-looking gash" after an SUV collided with the carriage she was pulling. The horse's head cracked the automobile's windshield after the animal was sideswiped.

**May 28, 2012/Milwaukee, Wisconsin:** A car hit a carriage and took off. The horse, Smokey, sustained cuts to his legs, and the driver was thrown from the carriage and sustained cuts and bruises. The carriage was operated by Milwaukee Coach and Carriage.

**May 10, 2012/St. Louis, Missouri:** A driver abandoned a carriage after a man allegedly hijacked it, and Harry, the horse being used by the St. Louis

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

Carriage Company, took off running for 10 blocks before crashing. The assailant jumped out and punched and kicked Harry before passersby intervened.

**April 28, 2012/Old Montréal, Québec:** A horse pulling a carriage bolted full-speed down the street. The driver was dragged before she fell off. Several parked vehicles were damaged, and the carriage was broken apart. The woman sustained minor injuries, but the horse's condition wasn't reported.

**December 18, 2011/New Orleans, Louisiana:** A horse pulling a rickshaw collapsed and died on Bourbon Street.

**December 16, 2011/Wichita Falls, Texas:** Several people were injured, including two who were hospitalized, after falling out of a carriage that turned over. The riders had been viewing holiday lights.

**December 4, 2011/New York, New York:** A horse pulling a carriage with four passengers near Central Park stumbled and fell to the street. A representative of the Horse and Carriage Association of New York downplayed the incident, saying the horse "caught [his] toe in the pavement, which is quite common."

**December 3, 2011/Hemet, California:** After participating in a Christmas parade, a spooked horse took off running, rolling over the animal's owner with the carriage and striking light poles and parked cars before collapsing. The owner was treated at the hospital.

**November 4, 2011/New York, New York:** A horse pulling a carriage collapsed in midtown.

**October 28, 2011/New York, New York:** A spooked horse charged into traffic and ran down the street before crashing. A witness reported that it was quiet and that it was unclear what had prompted the horse to bolt, saying, "The entire incident happened so fast and was extremely shocking. The horse took off at top speed and could not be stopped. He could have easily trampled a pedestrian."

**October 23, 2011/New York, New York:** A horse pulling a carriage collapsed and died in the street.

**September 25, 2011/Hampton Falls, New Hampshire:** Two horses pulling a carriage carrying about a dozen passengers bolted and collided with another carriage. A woman who tried to stop the horses was trampled and airlifted to the hospital with life-threatening injuries. Another passenger was

hospitalized with serious injuries, and four others sustained minor injuries.

**September 23, 2011/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse named Cletus lost his footing, slipped, and collapsed in front of Temple Square. He died later that evening.

**August 17, 2011/Mackinac Island, Michigan:** A witness reported seeing a horse collapse to the ground, have a seizure, and die. The carriage driver continued to pull on the reins in an effort to get the horse up while the animal was dying.

**July 28, 2011/New York, New York:** Three tourists and a carriage driver were hurt when a taxi rear-ended a horse-drawn carriage near Central Park. One passenger was thrown to the sidewalk, and the driver was in critical condition with a head injury. The horse was knocked to the ground, and the carriage fell on top of him.

**July 27, 2011/Quinton, Oklahoma:** Five people riding in a horse-drawn carriage died of massive injuries after a truck collided with the carriage.

**July 15, 2011/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse pulling a carriage spooked when he or she heard the air brake release from a nearby bus. The horse reared up, causing the carriage to jack-knife, and the passengers were thrown around inside it. The carriage was damaged, but no one was seriously injured.

**July 3, 2011/Toronto, Ontario:** While pulling a carriage, a pair of horses became spooked, bolted, and ran over the carriage's owner before the carriage flipped over. The rig's owner sustained broken ribs and was taken to the hospital, and two passengers were also taken to the hospital. One of the horses was injured.

**March 20, 2011/Natchez, Mississippi:** A horse-drawn carriage driver and several passengers sustained injuries when a car rear-ended the carriage, operated by Southern Carriage Tours. The driver was ejected and fell to the street, injuring his leg. The startled horse panicked and took off running. Some of the passengers sustained cuts from being thrown around in the carriage.

**February 12, 2011/Ottawa, Ontario:** Four people, including a 3-year-old girl, were injured after they were hit by a horse running through a park. The horse had been giving rides at a winter carnival. The operator later found the horse lying on a sidewalk. The toddler and another bystander were taken to the hospital, and two others were treated at the scene.

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

**November 3, 2010/New York, New York:** A horse was hit by a city bus in midtown Manhattan during rush hour. Witnesses say the horse looked traumatized, but after the carriage driver exchanged words with the bus driver, the carriage continued on its way.

**October 3, 2010/Palm Springs, California:** A horse was injured after a car smashed into the carriage she was pulling.

**July 31, 2010/Eureka, California:** The driver and owner of Old Town Carriage Co. was hospitalized with serious injuries after the horse who was pulling the carriage became spooked—possibly by a passing skateboarder—and took off running. The carriage crashed into a parked car and a wooden post, tossing the driver to the ground. One passenger complained of leg pain, and the horse, Cinnamon, also sustained injuries.

**July 4, 2010/Bellevue, Iowa:** A woman was killed and multiple children were trampled and injured when two horses who were pulling a carriage in the Heritage Days parade became spooked and took off, dragging the carriage through crowds of people at a ejected from the vehicle.

**May 31, 2010/Thunder Bay, Ontario:** A 4-year-old girl was killed after a horse became startled and bolted while being petted by the child and other kindergartners, who were on a field trip. The wheel of the carriage went over the toddler's body. Several other children were also injured.

**May 11, 2010/New York, New York:** Witnesses reported seeing a collision between a cab and a carriage.

**May 1, 2010/New York, New York:** Witnesses reported that a horse pulling a carriage became spooked and crashed near Central Park South after running against traffic and sideswiping several cars. The horse reportedly appeared to be injured, and several emergency vehicles responded to the scene.

**April 19, 2010/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** Five people were injured—including one man whose ear was partially ripped off—and five horses were injured when a car crashed into a horse-drawn carriage, triggering a chain-reaction crash involving two other carriages.

**April 16, 2010/Atlanta, Georgia:** Four riders were seriously injured—one critically—when the carriage in which they were riding was totaled after a car ran into it.

**April 10, 2010/New Bern, North Carolina:** At least three people were transported to the hospital after a car rear-ended a horse-drawn carriage that was being operated by Carolina Carriage Tours. The collision pushed the carriage into the horse, causing the horse to bolt. The horse was also injured.

**February 13, 2010/Fort Worth, Texas:** The driver of a horse-drawn carriage sustained a fractured eye socket, three broken bones in his back, a bruised lung, and a shoulder injury after his carriage was hit by a car in a hit-and-run collision.

**January 23, 2010/Mesa, Arizona:** A man was seriously injured and two horses were hurt after a barking dog startled four horses while they were pulling a carriage. The front two horses took off running, and the back two horses stumbled and were dragged along with the carriage approximately 75 feet down the street. The driver sustained serious road-rash injuries, some down to the bone. The back two horses also sustained road rash. A motorcycle driver was also injured when he had to lay down his motorcycle in an attempt to get out of the way of the out-of-control rig.

**December 27, 2009/Canandaigua, New York:** A horse was euthanized and four people were injured after a car hit a carriage from behind and all four passengers were ejected. Two were airlifted to a local hospital. The carriage was demolished.

**December 27, 2009/Sacramento, California:** A car struck a horse-drawn carriage from behind, upending the carriage and snapping it in half. The two riders were treated at a hospital after they and the driver were ejected from the carriage. The horse sustained leg injuries.

**December 25, 2009/Covington, Ohio:** A car crashed into a horse-drawn carriage, injuring the carriage driver and destroying the carriage. According to police, the carriage driver sustained a "fairly severe head injury" and was taken to the hospital. A passenger sustained minor injuries. This was the second carriage accident in Covington in one week.

**December 23, 2009/Covington, Ohio:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was startled and took off, flipping the carriage and ejecting the driver. The horse broke free and ran through the neighborhood before being recaptured.

**December 15, 2009/Stanley, Virginia:** Fourteen people on a holiday ride in a horse-drawn carriage were hurt when a car slammed into the carriage, ejecting the driver and causing the horses to run 100 yards before hitting an electric pole. All 14 people

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

were taken to the hospital, including one who had to be airlifted.

**December 6, 2009/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** A horse who was pulling carriages for holiday rides was startled by a bus and took off down the street, hitting a parked car and injuring the driver, who was standing nearby.

**November 20, 2009/Beachwood, Ohio:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was spooked by a high-school band and ran through a barricade and over a curb, colliding with two cars before breaking away from the carriage and taking off at a full gallop. The driver was injured after being pulled to the ground while trying to regain control.

**October 8, 2009/Charleston, South Carolina:** A horse pulling a carriage for Carolina Polo and Carriage Co. fell after his leg became caught in the carriage. The horse sustained abrasions but was put back to work the next day.

**September 23, 2009/Chicago, Illinois:** Two drivers who had worked for J.C. Cutters Horse Drawn Carriages were convicted of mistreating horses. Six horses were seized earlier in the year after animal-control officers repeatedly found horses who were coated with dirt and whose hooves were covered in manure as well as horses who were living in stalls in which manure was mixed with hay. The city had previously denied J.C. Cutters' application for a 2009 license to conduct carriage rides.

**September 19, 2009/New York, New York:** A cab plowed into a horse-drawn carriage near Central Park. Both drivers were taken to the hospital.

**August 29, 2009/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** A horse was injured after crashing and falling to the ground. The carriage collided with a pole.

**August 29, 2009/Québec, Canada:** Three children were ejected from a runaway carriage and sustained minor injuries after a team of ponies panicked and took off down the street during a community parade. The cart hit a car, throwing the driver under the rig and severing his leg below the knee.

**August 29, 2009/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse who was pulling a carriage containing a family of seven became startled and ran down the street before being stopped. The driver exited the rig, but the horse became frightened again and took off, dragging the driver until he was forced to let go while the horse continued running. A police officer riding a bike attempted to intervene, but his bike became tangled

with the carriage and he fell down while trying to stop the animal. The carriage came to a stop two blocks later when it hit a parked car. Both the driver and the police officer sustained minor injuries, and the carriage and the officer's bike were both totaled.

**August 7, 2009/Santa Barbara, California:** Several people were injured during the city's Old Spanish Days Fiesta parade when a horse pulling a carriage became spooked, ran out of control for nearly two blocks, and collided with another carriage. Both horses collapsed, and one lost consciousness and received aid from a veterinarian before reviving.

**August 6, 2009/Savannah, Georgia:** A horse pulling a carriage for Historic Savannah Carriage Tours became spooked, ran into traffic, and was hit by a car. A dog traveling in the carriage was injured and was taken to a veterinarian for treatment.

**August 1, 2009/Portland, Oregon:** A 23-year-old horse pulling a carriage in a wedding procession died after falling and breaking his leg.

**July 4, 2009/San Antonio, Texas:** A horse became spooked by a bus's air brakes and took off running through the downtown streets. The driver was thrown from the rig, and the horse broke free of the carriage and ran away. Later that day, the same horse lost balance after the carriage hit a curb on the way back to the barn, causing the rig to flip over. The driver was ejected.

**July 2009/Charleston, South Carolina:** Charleston officials issued the Carolina Polo and Carriage Co. six citations for various issues, including providing its horses the lowest quality feed and hay, submitting altered medical records, and using bleach to clean stalls (urine in the stalls produces ammonia, which, when mixed with bleach, can create toxic gas). The city issued five more citations after the company failed to meet deadlines to bring the operation up to code.

**July 2009/St. Augustine, Florida:** A case was settled for an undisclosed amount for a 2002 accident in which a Buffalo, New York, woman sustained serious neck and wrist injuries when a carriage that was changing lanes was struck in the side by a drunk driver. The carriage seat in which the woman and her husband were sitting broke loose and flipped backward.

**June 8, 2009/San Francisco, California:** A horse pulling a carriage became spooked, threw the driver out of the rig, and ran over him before taking off down the street near Fisherman's Wharf. After being stopped by a passerby, the horse broke free and ran down the Embarcadero, knocking at least two

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

bicyclists to the ground before being stopped. The driver died after spending two weeks in a coma.

**June 3, 2009/Mackinac Island, Michigan:** The driver of a carriage on Mackinac Island was injured after he was run over by his own rig after his horse was spooked by a dog.

**May 23, 2009/Morristown, New Jersey:** A man was taken to the hospital with broken ribs, severe scrapes, and bruising when two horses pulling a carriage in a parade became spooked and took off running. The man was thrown against the curb, was kicked, and became pinned under the carriage when it tipped over on top of him. A 9-year-old passenger was thrown to the street, and his 8-year-old friend clung to the side of the rig as the horses dragged it down the street. One horse sustained injuries, and the driver was also slightly injured. After the carriage was righted, the horses took off again, pulling the empty carriage.

**May 6, 2009/Mineral Wells, Texas:** A horse pulling a wagon in a rodeo parade bolted, injuring the driver and damaging a house and at least two parked cars. Bystanders were forced to run into a yard for safety, and a woman positioned her car between a mother with her baby and the horse, who was bolting toward them.

**April 24, 2009/Pratt, Kansas:** A man died and his wife was injured after a wheel came off the carriage in which they were riding and spooked the horses. The carriage went off the road, into a ditch, and up an incline before overturning. The man sustained a chest injury that punctured his lung, and he died during surgery. His wife sustained a sprained ankle. The couple was conducting a "test run" in preparation for an upcoming wedding ceremony.

**April 12, 2009/Logan, Utah:** The driver of a horse-drawn carriage was hospitalized after the carriage went off the road and tipped over.

**April 3, 2009/Nebraska City, Nebraska:** A horse pulling a carriage ran out of control and hit a curb, damaging a vehicle.

**March 26, 2009/Charleston, South Carolina:** A horse pulling a carriage with Classic Carriage Tours Co. was startled by the sound of construction machinery and ran down the street "at a high rate of speed." The driver had to veer the horse and carriage to the side of the road in order to avoid hitting pedestrians. The carriage overturned, bending a stop sign completely over onto the sidewalk.

**March 23, 2009/Salem, New York:** A horse pulling a carriage that held eight to 10 passengers became frightened and ran down a steep embankment. A 9-year-old boy was injured when the carriage overturned, and he was airlifted to the hospital. The other passengers sustained minor injuries.

**February 14, 2009/Waseca, Minnesota:** Two horses pulling a carriage during Waseca's Sleigh and Cutter Days Parade broke free and took off down the parade route. Witnesses reported that the driver was thrown into the street and was believed to have been taken to a nearby hospital. One woman sustained a foot injury, and a parked city truck was damaged.

**January 17, 2009/Eureka Springs, Arkansas:** A horse died of a heart attack while pulling a carriage for Southern Pride Carriage Tours.

**January 2009/Charleston, South Carolina:** A carriage with the Palmetto Carriage Co. hit the rear bumper of a police car. The carriage driver told police that the horse was "spooked" by a puddle of water.

**December 18, 2008/Fountain Inn, South Carolina:** A car struck a horse-drawn carriage. The driver reported that he didn't see the carriage in time to stop.

**December 15, 2008/St. Augustine, Florida:** A speeding car hit a horse-drawn carriage belonging to Avalon Carriage Services, causing the carriage to crash into another carriage. The accident spooked several horses. One horse bolted, causing a carriage to collide with a light pole. The accident caused several thousand dollars in damages.

**December 6, 2008/Fountain Inn, South Carolina:** One person was thrown to the ground and taken to the hospital after a car ran into the back of a horse-drawn carriage owned by Classic Carriage Co. Two other passengers later reported back injuries.

**November 28, 2008/Little Rock, Arkansas:** Six people, including two children, were injured when a bus struck a horse-drawn carriage owned by Little Rock Horse and Carriage Co. The carriage driver sustained a broken neck and had to have a steel plate, an artificial bone, and four screws inserted into her neck. Her right arm is partially paralyzed. A 7-year-old girl was blinded in her right eye. Doctors were unsure whether the damage to the girl's eye would be permanent.

**November 28, 2008/Rhineland, Wisconsin:** Horses pulling a Santa Claus in a carriage at a holiday event were startled by the lighting of a Christmas tree. Still harnessed to the carriage, the

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

horses bolted, ran over a man, collided with two light poles, and briefly ran loose in the city. The man was transported to a hospital. At least one parked vehicle was damaged.

**October 18, 2008/Charleston, South Carolina:** A horse with Classic Carriage Co. was startled when the rubber around one wheel of the carriage came off. The horse dashed between two parked cars, causing damage to the front bumper of one of the vehicles and overturning the carriage. The driver, who was thrown to the ground, sustained head injuries and was taken to the hospital.

**October 4, 2008/Portsmouth, Rhode Island:** Horses pulling a carriage at a sporting club became spooked and galloped into a wooded area where the carriage struck a wall and tipped over. Three passengers were injured.

**August 31, 2008/Brooklyn, New York:** Two horses waiting to pull a wedding carriage panicked when the pole that connected them to the carriage snapped. One of the carriage drivers was thrown from the buggy and landed on the windshield of an occupied Lincoln Town Car. The reins broke as the other carriage driver tried to steer the running horses, who eventually stopped when they encountered a light pole in their path. A man who was found under the carriage was taken to a nearby hospital, and one of the horses was treated for injuries.

**July 24, 2008/St. Augustine, Florida:** Three passengers in a horse-drawn carriage were treated for minor injuries at a local hospital after the horse made a sharp U-turn, flipping the buggy. The driver also sustained minor injuries, and the horse sustained scrapes and scratches.

**July 8, 2008/Memphis, Tennessee:** A pickup truck plowed into a horse-drawn carriage that was waiting for passengers, flipping the carriage over and tearing it in half. The carriage driver was taken to the hospital. The horse was knocked to the ground and sustained scratches on his legs.

**April 12, 2008/Cincinnati, Ohio:** A horse pulling a carriage tossed the driver and galloped along a sidewalk. Some of the four adult passengers jumped out of the carriage, and some fell out. The horse then dragged the overturned carriage at least another half-block before police stopped the animal. One passenger sustained a head injury, the driver sustained a back injury, and minor damage was done to a building.

**March 9, 2008/Waynesboro, Tennessee:** A man died after the horse-drawn carriage in which he was

riding was struck from behind by a car, throwing him from the carriage. The victim's daughter, the horse, and the carriage were knocked approximately 25 feet off the road. The impact also killed the horse.

**March 2008/Charleston, South Carolina:** According to news reports, someone struck the wheel of a horse-drawn carriage, spooking the horse and sending the carriage racing down the street. The carriage sustained approximately \$2,500 in damage.

**January 19, 2008/Charleston, South Carolina:** A horse with the Old South Carriage Co. became spooked and ran off, knocking an employee to the ground and dragging the carriage around a corner, where it broke a restaurant window.

**January 9, 2008/Charleston, South Carolina:** Six tourists in a carriage owned by Old South Carriage Co. were injured after a loose bridle slipped over the ears of the horse who was pulling their carriage and the horse became startled. The horse ran and dragged the carriage until it hit a curb, shattering a wheel. Three of the passengers were thrown from the carriage as it fell on its side.

**December 29, 2007/Farmington, Pennsylvania:** Five people, including two children, were injured when they were thrown to the ground after the horse-drawn carriage in which they were riding overturned. An adult woman and a young boy were pinned under the carriage. All five were taken to hospitals for treatment.

**December 16, 2007/Kansas City, Missouri:** Two horse-drawn carriages collided at an intersection, causing injuries to several people.

**December 13, 2007/Thomasville, Georgia:** A horse who had pulled carriages for years at the city's annual Victorian Christmas event became spooked and bolted while pulling a carriage with six passengers, then ran into a tree and a guy wire. The driver was pulled across the carriage's dashboard when the horse's harness came loose and broke. Passengers with minor injuries and a woman who experienced a panic attack were treated at the scene. The horse sustained a broken neck and other serious injuries and died as a result of the accident.

**December 8, 2007/St. Augustine, Florida:** A car ran into the back of a horse-drawn carriage belonging to the St. Augustine Transfer Co., pushing the carriage into two parked cars. The crash spooked the horse, who took off running. The horse continued to run when the carriage front broke, freeing him from the carriage. The drivers were thrown from the carriage and were badly bruised.

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

**September 14, 2007/New York, New York:** A horse who was spooked by a street performer's drum ran nearly a block along the sidewalk before slamming into a tree and suffering fatal injuries. The horse's panicking caused a second horse—who was still attached to a carriage—to dart into traffic and collide with a car.

**August 17, 2007/Cincinnati, Ohio:** A taxi hit the back of a carriage, knocking the carriage driver and two passengers out of the buggy. The horse—with the carriage in tow—bolted and ran into a moving vehicle. The horse sustained a gash on one leg, and the driver was taken to the hospital with a leg injury.

**August 3, 2007/Mackinac Island, Michigan:** A horse-drawn carriage operated by Gough Livery crashed through a fence, fell approximately 6 feet down an embankment, and hit a tree after one of the horses pulling it became spooked, which caused both horses to run. The impact threw the driver and two passengers from the carriage, and all three were taken by ambulance to the island's medical center for treatment. One of the passengers blacked out and needed 30 staples to close an injury to his scalp; the other passenger sustained a bruised kneecap and broken bones in her feet. The driver broke her femur, and one of the horses received stitches.

**July 29, 2007/Roanoke, Virginia:** Three people, including a 4-year-old girl and a 15-year-old girl, were hospitalized after being thrown from a runaway horse-drawn carriage. The carriage's two horses bolted, and the driver lost control. The carriage ran over the 15-year-old's leg.

**July 4, 2007/New York, New York:** A frightened horse who was pulling a carriage bolted and collided with a taxi on Central Park South. A motorcyclist abandoned his bike in order to avoid the horse. The cab driver was treated for injuries at the hospital, the horse sustained several gashes on one leg, and the cab sustained significant front-end damage.

**June 17, 2007/Council Grove, Kansas:** A car crashed into the back of a horse-drawn carriage, and a second car crashed into the back of the first car. Two people were taken to the hospital for injuries. The horse was euthanized because of severe injuries.

**June 9, 2007/St. Augustine, Florida:** Five passengers jumped out of a carriage when a horse bolted and ran for several blocks. Two people were injured, including one who was taken to the hospital and treated for injuries.

**June 2, 2007/New York, New York:** A spooked horse who was pulling a carriage was hit by an SUV

at an intersection after the horse galloped away from the driver. When the horse fell, the carriage broke loose, was propelled into the air, and landed on the curb, barely missing pedestrians.

**April 30, 2007/Blacksburg, Virginia:** Two horses were spooked when the carriage they were pulling sideswiped a curb. They bolted and ran at least a half-mile. A 73-year-old man and his daughter were thrown out of the carriage. The man was airlifted to the hospital.

**April 13, 2007/New York, New York:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was hit by a taxi at Grand Army Plaza.

**April 9, 2007/Indianapolis, Indiana:** A collision with a van threw a carriage driver to the ground and sent a driverless carriage racing through downtown Indianapolis with two passengers trapped inside. The driver was knocked unconscious, and both passengers were taken to the hospital and examined. A bystander who jumped into the carriage from a moving taxi was credited with saving the passengers' lives.

**September 14, 2006/New York, New York:** After collapsing in Central Park, Juliet, a horse who had pulled carriages in New York City for almost two decades, was whipped repeatedly by a carriage driver who was trying to get her to stand up. A horrified crowd gathered and begged the carriage driver to stop beating her. Juliet was eventually hauled away in a police trailer to her stable, where she died early the next morning.

**May 20, 2006/Chattanooga, Tennessee:** A horse pulling a carriage was spooked by buses and collided with a car that was stopped at a traffic light. The horse reared up, stomping on the roof of the car, shattering the back window, and crushing the trunk and hood. The horse sustained leg injuries.

**May 5, 2006/New York, New York:** A horse pulling a carriage through Manhattan became spooked and ran amok, narrowly missing several vehicles before colliding with and overturning a moving car. The driver of the car was hospitalized, and witnesses claimed that the horse sustained an open neck wound.

**April 28, 2006/New York, New York:** A young horse who was being trained to pull carriages suddenly became spooked and bolted, colliding with a 71-year-old bicyclist in Central Park. The bicyclist was hospitalized. The carriage driver jumped out of the vehicle during the incident and injured his knee.

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

**January 2, 2006/New York, New York:** A horse who was pulling a carriage in Manhattan suddenly bolted and collided with an automobile. The horse was pinned under the car and was later euthanized because of severe injuries. The carriage driver was hospitalized in critical condition with a fractured skull, and two men in the car were also seriously injured.

**September 30, 2005/Boston, Massachusetts:** A horse who was being used to pull carriages in downtown Boston collapsed in the street, where the animal, according to reports, “clapped the pavement with [his or her] hooves trying desperately to stand up.” More than two hours passed before a veterinarian arrived.

**June 22, 2005/Chicago, Illinois:** A spooked horse reared up, overturned the carriage he was pulling, and threw the driver into the street. The horse galloped down the street, hitting at least one car before he was stopped. One witness said, “He was really scared, scared to death, you could see it.” The driver went to the hospital with a broken leg.

**May 14, 2005/New York, New York:** Two horses broke free from their carriage after a hit-and-run collision with a van. The driver was thrown from the rig and landed on his head.

**September 5, 2004/Brewster, Massachusetts:** Two people were hospitalized with life-threatening injuries after several passengers were thrown from a horse-drawn carriage at a state park on Cape Cod. Two other riders sustained less serious injuries.

**September 5, 2004/Hamilton, Virginia:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was impaled and killed by a piece of the buggy after it was hit by a car. Two other horses sustained scrapes, and a fourth horse sustained leg injuries.

**August 28, 2004/Wilkes-Barre, Pennsylvania:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was severely injured after being struck by a hit-and-run driver.

**December 22, 2003/Kansas City, Missouri:** The driver of a horse-drawn carriage that carried six passengers was hospitalized with a broken leg after his carriage was involved in an accident.

**November 30, 2003/Louisville, Kentucky:** The driver of a horse-drawn carriage was injured after a car “clipped” the back of the rig. The accident was at least the third involving horse-drawn carriages in two years. Two horses were killed in 2002 after vehicle accidents.

**October 27, 2003:** An article in *Fortune* magazine detailed the financial costs of animal-related traffic accidents (including horse-drawn carriage accidents). The article said that the accidents cause \$1.2 billion in damage annually, according to the Insurance Information Institute.

**October 25, 2003/New York, New York:** Four people got the “scare of their lives” when a horse who was pulling a carriage suddenly bolted down the street and barreled into another carriage, causing both rigs to flip over. Four people were treated for injuries.

**October 5, 2003/Las Vegas, Nevada:** An article in the *Las Vegas Review-Journal* about transportation issues in the city recounted an accident in which a team of horses who were pulling a carriage bolted and threw two passengers, leaving one in a coma. The county subsequently banned horse-drawn carriages.

**September 5, 2003/Beaufort, Pennsylvania:** A woman was injured while attempting to board a horse-drawn carriage. The horse became spooked and started running, dragging the woman more than 100 feet through a parking lot.

**August 8, 2003/Apple Valley, California:** The driver of a horse-drawn hearse lost control of the horse during a practice run and jumped from the rapidly moving carriage. The horse and carriage ran into a wall and some cacti. The driver broke both of his arms and one of his legs. The horse received stitches to the face and had to have cactus spines removed.

**July 14, 2003/Covington, Ohio:** Horses who were pulling a carriage became spooked and caused the carriage to topple over onto the carriage driver. After the carriage was righted, the driver continued on, only to be fatally injured when the horses toppled the carriage again just a few blocks later.

**April 28, 2003/Honolulu, Hawaii:** A horse-drawn carriage that was carrying tourists flipped over, slightly injuring three of its nine passengers. The horses became spooked and toppled the wagon, spilling the passengers and driver onto the road.

**December 4, 2002/St. Augustine, Florida:** A vehicle crashed into a horse-drawn carriage, ejecting the guide and two riders. The driver of the vehicle who hit the carriage was charged with driving under the influence, and police cited the carriage driver for pulling into the car’s path. The riders were taken to the hospital.

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

**October 30, 2002/Pennsylvania:** An article in *The Patriot-News* reported that there were 371 horse-and- buggy crashes in Pennsylvania from 1996 through 2000, which resulted in 18 deaths and 442 injuries.

**October 11, 2002/Belding, Indiana:** The parents of a 4-year-old boy who was killed while riding in a horse-drawn carriage filed a wrongful death lawsuit against the carriage service and the city of Belding. The boy, his siblings, and his mother were riding in a Christmas carriage event when a horse became spooked, reared up, and bolted. The boy was run over after he was thrown from the carriage. The parents filed a lawsuit, seeking more than \$1 million.

**July 8, 2002/Madison, Wisconsin:** After the occupants of a passing car threw firecrackers at a horse who was pulling a carriage, the animal broke free and raced through 10 blocks of traffic before stopping. At one point, a passerby jumped into the carriage but was thrown when the horse swerved and the carriage struck a curb.

**January 22, 2002/New York, New York:** A horse who was pulling a carriage through traffic became frightened and bolted. The carriage became wedged between two cars, damaging both of them as well as other vehicles. The horse had to be tranquilized, and it took the efforts of several people to free the animal



and the carriage.

**2002/Louisville, Kentucky:** A 17-year-old horse named Pam and a 7-year-old horse named Della were killed in separate vehicle-related accidents.

**December 8, 2001/Belding, Indiana:** A 4-year-old boy fell out of a horse-drawn carriage when the animal who was pulling the carriage bolted. The boy was run over by the carriage and died soon after at an area hospital. Another passenger sustained minor injuries. City officials said that the horse had been

spooked by a passing car. The carriage company suspended operations after the incident.

**November 26, 2001/New York, New York:** A taxi collided with a horse-drawn carriage in Central Park, startling the horse and injuring the carriage driver.

**July 27, 2001/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** A spooked horse ran amok in downtown traffic. The carriage collided with two cars before it tipped over and struck a third vehicle. The carriage driver, one of the car's occupants, and the horse were injured.

**July 13, 2001/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** A horse broke free from a carriage in downtown traffic. The carriage then ran into three cars before falling over. Two tourists, who jumped out of the carriage just before it toppled, were taken to a nearby hospital for treatment. This accident and the one on July 27 in which a carriage in Philadelphia collided with two cars prompted a member of the mayor's Animal Advisory Committee to voice concerns about horse-drawn carriage operations. He stated, in part, "Horses and traffic like this don't mix."

**December 1, 2000/Old Bridge, New Jersey:** Several members of a wedding party were injured when a horse stumbled and the carriage that they were riding in crashed onto its side. The horse trampled the carriage driver, who was critically injured. A 6-year-old boy was taken to a nearby hospital for evaluation, and others sustained cuts and bruises.

**November 2000/New York, New York:** A horse who was pulling a carriage broke free, bolted, and collided with a car while galloping down the street. The horse tripped and fell to the ground, injuring a leg.

**September 18, 2000/Chicago, Illinois:** A horse who had bolted from a wedding in Lincoln Park after being stung by a bee broke free from the carriage after it became wedged between two cars. The horse and a pedestrian were injured.

**August 27, 2000/New York, New York:** A horse-drawn carriage that was turning a corner in Central Park tilted past its balance point and suddenly slammed onto its side. Four tourists were strapped to backboards and were taken by ambulance to a nearby hospital.

**April 26, 2000/New York, New York:** A horse in a carriage-ride stable escaped and ran down the street, creating havoc as drivers slammed on their brakes to avoid hitting the animal. A traffic control officer avoided serious injury by jumping back when the

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

horse came within 3 feet of her. The horse narrowly missed being hit by a bus.

**March 30, 2000/Pullman, Washington:** Three students were injured (one seriously enough to require hospitalization) and a horse was badly injured when the animal bolted down city streets for “no obvious reason.”

**December 24, 1999/Charleston, South Carolina:** A horse collapsed and lay moaning in the street for several hours before a veterinarian arrived to euthanize the animal.

**December 24, 1999/Dover, Delaware:** One person was partially paralyzed and two others were injured after a truck ran into the carriage in which they were riding.

**December 13, 1999/Sarnia, Ontario:** During pre-Christmas festivities, a woman was dragged to death when the horses she was unhitching after a wagon ride bolted. The woman became entangled in a harness and was killed when she was thrown into a hydro pole. The woman had spent the day offering rides at a city park. Just three weeks earlier, another pair of horses had run amok in Sarnia, denting cars.

**December 7, 1999/Eastham, Massachusetts:** Twenty Christmas festival participants were injured when a pickup truck rammed into the horse-drawn wagon that they were riding in, tipping it over. Some of the riders, including several small children, became trapped beneath the wagon.

**November 27, 1999/Holland, Pennsylvania:** A man was injured when his horse-drawn buggy collided with a car. Both vehicles sustained damage.

**November 24, 1999/New Orleans, Louisiana:** Three horses escaped their barn and ran through the streets of New Orleans before one struck a bus and broke its windshield.

**August 10, 1999/Helen, Georgia:** The driver of a carriage was dragged along the ground and sustained injuries after a spooked horse ran away from the carriage while giving rides in downtown Helen, Georgia. Police officials were not certain what had spooked the horse.

**August 5, 1999/New York, New York:** A runaway horse who was pulling a carriage jumped onto the sidewalk, injuring two elderly pedestrians and hitting a car.

**July 4, 1999/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse who was pulling a carriage at Heritage Park ran amok; nine people were hospitalized following the incident.

**June 28, 1999/New York, New York:** A hit-and-run driver crashed into a horse-drawn carriage, breaking the driver’s jaw and sending the horse galloping down the street. The horse was later hit by an oncoming car.

**May 30, 1999/Baltimore, Maryland:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was killed by an oncoming car after the driver ran a red light. Another horse pulling a carriage was spooked by the incident and ran for eight blocks, injuring a passenger.

**April 7, 1999/Philadelphia, Pennsylvania:** Two horses who were pulling carriages collided, throwing three passengers 10 feet into the air and out into the street.

**April 4, 1999/Orlando, Florida:** A speeding car hit a carriage that was being pulled by a horse, prompting the terrified animal to run through the streets, injuring four bystanders.

**February 19, 1999/Cincinnati, Ohio:** Four people, including three children, were injured when a truck collided with the carriage in which they were riding.

**January 8, 1999/New York, New York:** A horse was fatally electrocuted while pulling a carriage.

**1999/Apple Valley, California:** A horse pulling an old-fashioned hearse became spooked and ran through a parade, injuring two people and damaging four vehicles.

**December 14, 1998/Milwaukee, Wisconsin:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was hit by a car and sustained serious injuries. Police killed the horse with four shotgun blasts. The carriage driver sustained neck and back injuries. The driver of the car was also treated for injuries.

**October 13, 1998/Sheridan, Indiana:** One man was injured when a train whistle spooked his horses. The horses ran at full speed through three four-way–stop intersections before finally slamming into a tree.

**July 20, 1998/Duluth, Minnesota:** Two carriages carrying passengers and drivers overturned.

**July 10, 1998/Markesan, Wisconsin:** Four people were injured after a horse became spooked.

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

**April 29, 1998/New York, New York:** A horse broke the halter, ran into a busy street, and was killed by an oncoming car. The driver of the car was treated for back injuries.

**January 17, 1998/New York, New York:** A spooked horse ran wild, overturning the carriage that he was pulling.

**1998/New York, New York:** A horse ran amok in Times Square. Two passengers jumped to safety just seconds before the carriage that the animal was pulling slammed into a light pole.

**November 24, 1997/New York, New York:** A runaway horse in Central Park struck and injured a pedestrian. The carriage also damaged a car.

**November 18, 1997/Dallas, Texas:** Passing motorcycles spooked a horse, causing the animal to crash into a vehicle. The driver was thrown from the carriage, and the horse sustained a cut that required stitches.

**September 12, 1997/Mechanicsville, Maryland:** A woman and her three children were injured when a van collided with their horse-drawn carriage. The spooked horse broke free and ran a quarter-mile before being killed by a car. The family was airlifted to a local hospital for treatment.

**September 4, 1997/New York, New York:** An elderly woman was seriously injured and eight other people were hurt when two carriages overturned after the horses who were pulling them were spooked by a passing car.

**August 12, 1997/Boston, Massachusetts:** A horse who was pulling a carriage had to be euthanized after the carriage was hit by a truck. The horse's body was punctured by shattered wooden shafts. The driver was hospitalized with a fractured ankle and other injuries. The driver of the truck left the scene without stopping.

**July 2, 1997/Kingsport, Tennessee:** A newlywed husband and wife were injured when a car rear-ended the horse-drawn carriage in which the two were riding. Both riders were hospitalized, and one sustained serious injuries.

**May 1, 1997/New York, New York:** A horse who was pulling a carriage tripped and died while struggling to get up.

**December 20, 1996/Kansas City, Missouri:** A pregnant horse collapsed in the middle of a street

while pulling a carriage and later died. The horse was believed to have been going into labor.

**November 11, 1996/Cocoa Beach, Florida:** Newlyweds who were riding in a horse-drawn carriage were injured when the carriage was rear-ended by a car. The couple and the driver of the carriage all required treatment at a local hospital. The horse sustained a broken leg and was euthanized.

**October 1996/Dallas, Texas:** A horse who was pulling a carriage ran into a crowd. Eleven people were injured.

**June 4, 1996/Branson, Missouri:** A 10-year-old boy was killed when a horse-drawn carriage overturned, throwing 11 passengers to the ground.

**1996/Denver, Colorado:** Two horses who were pulling a carriage became spooked and took off down the street for six blocks before crashing into a light pole. The passengers leaped off the carriage before it crashed. One horse sustained a broken eye socket, and the carriage was destroyed.

**May 7, 1995/New York, New York:** Twelve children and four adults were injured when a horse who was powering a ride at a carnival "went berserk," throwing passengers off the ride and running over them.

**October 31, 1994/Frederick, Maryland:** Seven people were injured when the horse who was pulling the carriage in which they were riding bolted down the street. The carriage sideswiped five cars before it overturned and the passengers fell out.

**October 1994/Dallas, Texas:** A driver was killed when a car slammed into her carriage.

**August 22, 1994/Branford, Connecticut:** Thirteen people were injured when two horses who were pulling a carriage became spooked and took off down the street, crashing into a parked car.

**April 29, 1994/New York, New York:** Following an error in a horse's diet, the animal experienced severe cramps and had to be euthanized after collapsing in Central Park.

**December 19, 1993/Plantation, Florida:** Two horses who were pulling a wagon ran out of control, injuring all 12 people on board. One of the injured riders was run over by the wheels of the wagon and was hospitalized in serious condition. Both horses sustained serious cuts to their legs.

## Incidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages

**November 23, 1992/Salt Lake City, Utah:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was struck from behind by a car and was thrown to the ground along with four passengers. The panicked horse bolted down the street and was hit by another car.

**September 9, 1991/Cleveland, Ohio:** A horse who was pulling a carriage bolted and collided with a car, falling on the car's roof. The driver of the car and the horse were both killed.

**September 9, 1991/Houston, Texas:** Two people were hospitalized when the horse-drawn carriage in which they were riding went out of control and hit a police car. The horse sustained extensive injuries. The driver of the carriage said at the scene, "[H]e's a hard horse to control," because he had already been hit by cars on three previous occasions.

**August 25, 1991/New York, New York:** A horse had to be euthanized after suffering from crippling leg cramps.

**May 15, 1990/New York, New York:** A horse who was pulling a carriage was fatally injured in Manhattan after becoming trapped between a bus and a car.

**December 4, 1989/Kansas City, Missouri:** The driver of a carriage was injured after the horses bolted and collided with four parked vehicles and a car that was stopped in traffic.

**September 4, 1989/Baltimore, Maryland:** A driver of a horse-drawn carriage was killed when the carriage was hit by a car.

**August 1, 1989/Columbus, Ohio:** A horse took off down the street, pulling a driverless carriage behind him. The owner of the carriage said, "When a horse gets spooked, you have to let him run until he stops." The business had been involved in at least three other accidents since it began operating in 1981.

**May 23, 1988/New York, New York:** A horse who was pulling a carriage fell into a hole in the street.

**November 9, 1986/New York, New York:** Frightened by a passing car, a horse took off down the street and crashed into a building.

**December 9, 1985/New York, New York:** Two horses who were pulling a carriage became spooked by a passing car and ran out of control. Four people were injured and a car's windshield was smashed when one of the horses jumped onto the hood. The horse was euthanized.



Working  
Animal  
Advocates

www.workinganimal.org

November 28, 2012

*Via Email*

Ms. Liz Brenner, Manager  
Old Sacramento Historic District Office  
City of Sacramento  
922 Second Street, 2nd Floor  
Sacramento, CA 95814

**RE: Horse-Drawn Carriages in Old Sacramento**

Dear Ms. Brenner,

We are writing to express our concern for the welfare of the carriage horses in Old Sacramento. Over the past few months we have observed the horses on numerous occasions and documented their working conditions. As a result of our observations, we have noted several violations of Sacramento City Code Section 10.64 (“the Carriage Code”) and other serious issues that need to be addressed in order to ensure the humane treatment and safety of the horses, as well as the safety of the public. We ask that you review the list below and kindly provide us with a written response on how these violations and other issues will be addressed by the City of Sacramento.

**I. Location of the Thermometer Used to Regulate Working Temperatures**

Section 10.64.110 D (2) of The Carriage Code states: *“No animal shall work when a thermometer, placed at a street level location selected by the director, registers one hundred (100) degrees F., except that when an operator previously entered into an agreement to provide service on such date, an animal may be worked for the previously agreed upon service only.”*

Section 10.64.110 D (1) of The Carriage Code states: *“An animal shall be rested and watered for at least twenty (20) minutes after two hours of work and at least thirty (30) minutes after both four hours (total) and six hours (total) of work. When the outdoor temperature exceeds ninety (90) degrees F., the rest shall be provided in a shaded location.”*

The current location of the official thermometer that is authorized by the City of Sacramento for the carriage operators to use for the purpose of determining when it is too hot for a horse to work and for when horses should be getting their breaks in the shade is in violation of the code because it is not at a street level location. It is located 13.5 feet from the ground, up high on the north side of a building under shade of a balcony and does not accurately reflect the street level temperature where the horses are working. We have used six different thermometers to compare the street level temperature to that of the

thermometer used by the City and have recorded a consistently higher reading of five to ten degrees Fahrenheit on our thermometers when placed at street level in the shade directly under the location of the official thermometer. Thus, the violation of the requirement that the official thermometer be located at street level is a material violation of the Ordinance that has direct adverse health impacts on the horses. It is important to note that even if the official thermometer was properly located at street level, the shade is not where the horses are located and so is not a true reflection of the street temperature where they are working. Please see Attachment 1.

As a result of the improper placement of the thermometer and resulting erroneously low temperatures, the carriage horses do not receive their breaks in the shade when they should and are worked when the street level temperature is above 100 degrees. Please correct this violation of the Carriage Code so that horses will be given their proper breaks in the shade when street level temperatures are at 90 degree temperatures, and so they will be removed from working when the street temperature reaches 100 degrees. As our planet heats up due to global warming and Sacramento continues to set new heat records as it did in September, it will be more important than ever that the measurement of these temperatures be accurate for the welfare and safety of the horses. The city of Baltimore requires each carriage to be equipped with a thermometer located on the side of the carriage, and we would suggest that as a possible solution Sacramento should consider, provided there would be proper regulation and enforcement.

We note that the improper placement of the City's thermometer and its resulting consequences for the horses was brought to your attention by Animal Legal Defense Fund in August and to date has still not been corrected.

## **II. Lack of Rest Periods**

Section 10.64.110 D (1) of The Carriage Code states: *“No animal shall work for more than eight hours per day. An animal shall be deemed to be working whenever it is attached to a horse-drawn vehicle. An animal shall be rested and watered for at least twenty (20) minutes after two hours of work and at least thirty (30) minutes after both four hours (total) and six hours (total) of work. When the outdoor temperature exceeds ninety (90) degrees F., the rest shall be provided in a shaded location.”*

Upon observing the horses continuously for three to five hour periods of time on numerous occasions, we have never seen the horses unharnessed for their breaks. If a horse is defined as *working* when harnessed to a carriage, then necessarily they must be unharnessed and detached from their carriage when *not working* during rest periods. In addition, we have never seen the horses receive a 20 or 30 minute uninterrupted period of rest even when attached to the carriage. It is our understanding from talking with one of the carriage operators from Top Hand Ranch that they consider the horses to be getting their rest whenever they are standing at the hack line in between rides. We assert that a couple minutes here and there in between fares, often standing in full exposure of the sun, is not a proper form of rest as required by the code, and that on busy days, these minutes in between fares do not add up to a full 20 or 30 minute break, even if they were considered part of their rest period.

We have several documented examples of horses not being properly rested as revealed by time/date stamped photos showing the horses in a constant state of work in which a proper 20 or 30 minute break, unharnessed and in the shade, could not have occurred. Please see Attachment 2 for a few of our examples.

### **III. Horses Being Trotted at a Fast Pace**

Section 10.64.110 A (4) of the Carriage Code states: *"Horses or other animals used to draw vehicles shall be worked no faster than at a slow trot. When traffic permits, the animal shall be walked."*

It is routine practice for horses to be run uphill on 2<sup>nd</sup> Street as they return from the Promenade, Park and Capitol routes. Please see video evidence on our website at [www.workinganimal.org](http://www.workinganimal.org).

### **IV. Violation of Basic Traffic Laws**

Section 10.64.110 A (1) of the Carriage Code states: *"Drivers of horse-drawn vehicles shall obey all traffic laws and regulations of the city and the state."*

It is routine practice for carriages to run stop signs at the intersection of 2nd Street and Neasham Circle. Please see videos demonstrating this on our website at [www.workinganimal.org](http://www.workinganimal.org).

We have also witnessed carriages obstructing the flow of traffic, parking illegally in a disabled parking zone on J Street and making illegal u-turns near the intersection of 2nd and J Streets. Please see photos and videos on our website at [www.workinganimal.org](http://www.workinganimal.org).

### **V. Lack of Proper Record Keeping and Reporting of Accidents and Injuries**

Section 10.64.110 E (5) of the Carriage Code states: *"One copy of the health passport/work log shall be kept with the animal at all times. East [sic] operator shall provide a copy of the health passport/work log for every animal used in his or her operation to Old Sacramento management office by the 5th of each month for the previous calendar month."*

We have made two formal document requests under the California Public Records Act that expressly requested all such health passport/work logs and the City has not provided even a single such document as are required to be submitted to the City by the carriage operators showing the dates and times horses were worked; see Section 10.64.110 E (4) of the Carriage Code.

We are also aware of two incidents in which horses were attacked by dogs on December 21, 2010 and March 4, 2012, and of a hit and run accident on December 28, 2009, in which a carriage was hit by a car. Horses were injured in each case as well as injuries to passengers in the hit-and-run accident. Other than a very brief accident report involving the March 2012 dog attack incident, we received no documentation in response to our Public Records Act requests regarding the other dog attack incident or the hit-and-run accident (other than a call log from an unidentified source of calls made reporting the accident). Thorough investigative reports of such incidents should be kept and made available as a matter of public record.

### **VI. Other Carriage Code Violations**

Other violations of the Carriage Code we have witnessed include carriage operators not being dressed in historical attire, horses defecating in the street without clean-up by the operators, carriage operators picking up passengers in non-designated locations and carriage operators eating and drinking while driving. Examples of some of these violations which we were able to capture on photo or video can be seen on our website at [www.workinganimal.org](http://www.workinganimal.org).

## VII. Inhumane Working Conditions

In addition to the above violations of the Carriage Code, the following factors do not provide for humane working conditions for the horses:

- **High Temperatures**

Section 10.64.110 D (2) of the Carriage Code states: *“No animal shall work when a thermometer, placed at a street level location selected by the director, registers one hundred (100) degrees F., except that when an operator previously entered into an agreement to provide service on such date, an animal may be worked for the previously agreed upon service only.”*

We surveyed horse-drawn carriage regulations in more than 15 major U.S. cities and found that Sacramento has established one of the highest temperatures at which horses must cease working to protect them against heat exhaustion. The only city we found with a higher threshold temperature was Memphis, Tennessee, at 101°F. As seen below, most cities have lower maximum temperature regulations governing their working horses.

Maximum Temperature (°F) for Horse-Drawn Carriages in Select U.S. Cities:

Memphis, TN – 101	Kansas City, MO – 97	Seattle, WA – 91
Sacramento, CA – 100	St. Augustine, FL – 95	Chicago, IL - 90
Dallas, TX – 100	Baltimore, MD – 93	Cleveland, OH – 90
Charleston, SC – 98	Philadelphia, PA – 92	New York City, NY - 90
Atlanta, GA – 97	Portland, OR – 91	Washington, DC – 90

During the hot summer months in Sacramento, when daily temperatures are 90<sup>+</sup> degrees, the horses work exposed to the sun in blistering heat for hours non-stop as they pull carriages and stand at the hack line in between fares. On several occasions, we noted carriage operators who would get down from their carriages in order to stand in the shade for relief while their horses were left to stand in full exposure of the sun. And as previously mentioned and shown by the attached time/date stamped photos, these horses never received their proper 20 or 30 minute breaks in the shade as required by the Carriage Code when temperatures are over 90 degrees. They also did not have free access to water in between fares and instead had to rely on their carriage operators to provide it to them which at most was approximately once every couple of hours. We noted one occasion in which Fox, the horse driven by Wolverton Carriage Company, worked for three hours in 90<sup>+</sup> degree temperatures before finally receiving a drink of water, and only after we made an issue of it with the operator.

Carriage horses forced to work in very high temperatures are at risk of heat stroke and heat exhaustion, which can be as life-threatening for them as it is for humans. Cal OSHA has determined that strenuous work in direct sunlight can effectively add 15 degrees to the measured heat index as experienced by workers. Further, Cal OSHA warns that working in the heat in low humidity settings can quickly result in dehydration and heat exhaustion. These conditions likewise apply to the horses working in Old Sacramento and should be a matter of consideration by the City.

If the City of Sacramento is going to have horse-drawn carriages, we request the maximum temperature that horses must toil be lowered to a more humane temperature that does not pose health risks to the horses. We would also request that water, a shade canopy and a dirt surface for standing be

provided at the hack line so that the horses have some relief from the blistering heat and hard, hot ground while waiting for fares.

- **Traffic and Busy City Streets**

Carriage horses in Old Sacramento are made to wear blinders on their eyes so that they will be less likely to get spooked from the many cars, motorcycles, trucks, bicyclists, pedestrians and companion animals that surround them and cross their paths. They must constantly stop and start and navigate around traffic. In addition, they often obstruct the flow of traffic, resulting in motorized vehicles having to pass around them. These circumstances are not humane for the horses and pose great risks to both public and horse safety.

As previously mentioned, in recent years, there was an accident involving a collision with a motor vehicle that resulted in injuries to the horse as well as to two passengers, and two incidents in which horses were attacked and injured by dogs, resulting in one of the dogs being shot and killed. These cases demonstrate the uncontrollable risks to safety that exist for the horses, carriage operators, passengers, the public, and their companion animals when horse-drawn carriages are allowed to operate in busy urban environments. When faced with a potential threat, horses are either rendered immobile and defenseless as a result of being harnessed and attached to a braked carriage, or they pose a danger to themselves and everyone in their path when frightened and able to flee.

It should be noted that in the 2012 dog attack incident, there were four passengers all under the age of 18 who could have been seriously harmed. Episodes involving injuries and death to horses and people occur with regularity in cities across the country where horse-drawn vehicles still operate, and accidents are sure to occur again in Sacramento. Please see Attachment 3 for a comprehensive record of injuries and accidents involving horse-drawn carriages in the United States.

If the City of Sacramento is going to have horse-drawn carriages, we request that Old Sacramento be made into a pedestrian-only zone so that some of the dangers to public and horse safety which come from horses and motorized vehicles having to share limited space on congested city streets be reduced.

- **Pollution**

Carriage horses must constantly breathe in exhaust fumes from vehicular traffic which puts them at risk for respiratory disease. Please see the attached statement and information (Attachment 4) from noted equine veterinarian Dr. Holly Cheever, DVM, who worked many years for the ASPCA regulating the carriage horse industry in New York City. She is an expert in the field who is regularly consulted by city councils who have horse-drawn carriage industries in their cities.

Further, urban air pollution and exhaust fumes are made more hazardous in high temperatures. Cities recognize this fact by declaring very hot days as "spare the air" days in order to minimize the detrimental effects of smog pollution on public health and the environment. In order to reduce these same harmful effects of pollution on horse health, we would again request that they not have to work in very high temperatures or be exposed to auto exhaust fumes.

- **Hard City Streets**

The horses in Old Sacramento must constantly pound hard, concussive streets made of asphalt and

cobblestone which subject them to hoof and leg injury, arthritis and lameness. Hard city streets of asphalt and cobblestone are unnatural and do not provide a healthy, humane environment for horses. In order to reduce the potential damage, pain and injury caused to horses from working on hard city streets, we would request that the City of Sacramento greatly limit the hours carriage horses are forced to work each day. Portland, Oregon has set a daily maximum limit of five hours and we would recommend a five hour limit in Sacramento as well.

- **Loud Noise**

In addition to the cacophony of loud sounds on the streets of Old Sacramento—including honking horns, car alarms, roaring motorcycles, loud music and train whistles from the nearby train station—carriage horses are routinely exposed to very high levels of noise several times a day whenever they must travel right along the freeway on 2nd Street en route to and from the Promenade, Park or Capitol destinations. We measured the noise levels along the freeway using a decibel meter and consistently measured levels averaging between 75 and 85 decibels and at times even above 90 decibels. Please see video evidence on our website at [www.workinganimal.org](http://www.workinganimal.org). According to the American Speech-Language Hearing Association ([www.asha.org/public/hearing/Noise/](http://www.asha.org/public/hearing/Noise/)), sustained and routine exposure to noise at these levels can damage hearing and should be avoided. As prey animals, horses have a keen sense of hearing that is more sensitive than our own, so it stands to reason that these noise levels could likewise cause damage to their hearing and therefore should be a matter of study and consideration by the City before continuing to subject them to such noise levels. Moreover, horse-drawn carriage accidents often occur as a result of horses getting spooked by loud and/or startling noises (please see Attachment 3).

If the City of Sacramento is going to have horse-drawn carriages in Old Sacramento, we request that it provide as humane an environment as possible by eliminating cars on the streets of Old Sacramento and eliminate the routes that cause the horses to go right along the freeway and be exposed to such unhealthy and stressful noise levels.

### **VIII. Purpose and Enforcement of the Carriage Code**

Section 10.64.010 of the Carriage Code states: *“The purpose of this chapter is to regulate the operation of horse-drawn vehicles in the city, in order to insure that horse-drawn vehicles are operated safely, to protect the public health, safety and welfare, and, in Old Sacramento, to help preserve, recapture and maintain the historic ambience of the area.”*

Section 10.64.020 of the Carriage Code states: *“Additional regulation of horse-drawn vehicle operations in Old Sacramento and throughout the city is necessary. Experience with the operation of horse-drawn vehicles in Old Sacramento has raised several concerns requiring legislative action:*

*A. Operators/drivers sometimes do not inform patrons in advance and clearly of the route, length and price of the ride being offered.*

*B. Prospective patrons do not have an adequate opportunity to compare the price and quality of offerings by different operators before selecting a vehicle to board.*

*C. Operation of too many horse-drawn vehicles at once in the three-square block area of Old Sacramento causes confusion, obstruction of motor vehicle traffic on the public streets and increased risks for pedestrians.*

*D. Animals used to draw vehicles may be adversely affected by hot summer days, lack of adequate watering and other working conditions. (Prior code § 25.12.250-1)*

We contend that due to all the aforementioned violations, inhumane working conditions and threats to horse and public safety, the purpose of the Carriage Code is not being met. Based on our observations, and on the documents the City produced in response to our California Public Records Act requests, the only evidence of horse-drawn vehicles being regulated, or of the Carriage Code being enforced, appears to be with the "paper requirements," such as the payment of license fees, filing of permit applications, and the issuance of insurance certificates.

One of the stated goals of having horse-drawn vehicles in Old Sacramento is to "*preserve, recapture and maintain the historic ambience of the area.*" There is nothing nostalgic or historically accurate about horse-drawn carriages being in congested traffic, alongside cars, motorcycles, trucks, bicycles and limousines, amidst sounds of honking horns, car alarms, loud music and freeway noise. This modern, urban environment is not only unsafe and inhumane for the horses, but the presence of horse-drawn carriages in this setting is incongruent and does not contribute to recapturing the historic ambience of the area.

### **IX. Relief Requested**

In the paragraphs above, Working Animal Advocates has made numerous suggestions on how the City should improve its regulation of horse-drawn carriage operations. However, given the City's apparent inability to enforce the Carriage Code, and in light of the inhumane realities inherent in the carriage industry described herein, we respectfully suggest that the City must consider the elimination of horse-drawn carriages from Old Sacramento. Many cities, including Reno and Las Vegas, NV; Santa Fe, NM; Camden, NJ; Palm Beach, Deerfield Beach, Key West, Panama City Beach and Venice, FL; Biloxi, MS; Toronto, Canada; Beijing, China; London, England and Paris, France have enacted bans on horse-drawn carriages. Sacramento's current horse-drawn industry practices make a compelling case for Sacramento joining the ranks of such cities by responding to the inhumane treatment of horses forced to work pulling carriages by enacting a ban on horse-drawn carriages.

Should the City decide to continue to allow the operation of horse-drawn carriages, we respectfully assert that the City must immediately initiate real and demonstrable enforcement of the Carriage Code and in particular with respect to violations of the sections enumerated herein. In either event, we respectfully request a formal investigation and review of current practices and a written response on how the city intends to address the issues raised in this letter.

Working Animal Advocates hopes the City will meet its obligation with respect to the issues presented in this letter. However, should the City demonstrate an unwillingness to take its enforcement obligations seriously, Working Animal Advocates will, unfortunately, be compelled to pursue other available legal and public means to encourage the City to embrace its enforcement obligations and ensure the humane treatment of working horses.

Thank you for your time and attention to this matter.

Sincerely,



Kim Flaherty  
Working Animal Advocates

cc: Kevin Johnson, Mayor  
Angelique Ashby, Council Member, District One  
Sandy Sheedy, Council Member, District Two  
Steve Cohn, Council Member, District Three  
Robert King Fong, Council Member, District Four  
Jay Schenirir, Council Member, District Five  
Kevin McCarty, Council Member, District Six  
Darrell Fong, Council Member, District Seven  
Bonnie Pannell, Council Member, District Eight  
Jerry Way, Director of Transportation  
Reina J. Schwartz, Director, Dept. of General Services  
Kourtney C. Burdick, Deputy City Attorney  
Rick Braziel, Chief of Police

**Holly Cheever, DVM**  
**665 Clipp Rd.**  
**Voorheesville, NY 12186**  
**518-765-4213**

August 20, 2013

Mayor Kevin Johnson  
Members of the Sacramento City Council  
915 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

Dear Mayor Johnson and members of the Sacramento City Council:

I have been asked to offer my expertise and advice to improve the working conditions for the carriage horses used in the tourist trade in your city. My attached presentation to the Philadelphia Bar Institute cites my credentials and long history (since 1988) in advising municipalities and two states (Florida and Massachusetts) in working to improve carriage horse care and working conditions. If carriage horse rides cannot be banned in inappropriate and stressful urban settings, then it is critically important that protective regulations and **THE MEANS TO ENFORCE THEM** be promulgated. Because these tourist attractions cannot be maintained humanely in the 21<sup>st</sup> century's busy urban settings with their high volume of vehicular traffic, it is my opinion that they should be phased out and eventually banned, in the interests of humane treatment of the horses involved.

My attached presentation gives an in-depth synopsis of the hazards and abuses facing carriage horses in modern urban settings; I urge you all to review this article. Because of Sacramento's history of their carriage horse injuries and working conditions, I direct your attention to the sections on **lameness**, **heat stress**, and **spooking**, and will also comment on their "**rest periods**" as specified in your city regulations pertaining to this industry.

**LAMENESS:** In addition to the analysis in the attached presentation, I would add that Sacramento has cobbled streets in some sections, which are particularly punishing on equine hooves, limbs, and shoeing. As stated, pounding continually on unnaturally hard concussive surfaces is very stressful on the equine musculoskeletal system, and will both create and exacerbate lameness. Any horse exhibiting lameness should be promptly evaluated by an equine veterinarian and given pain management and sufficient rest to permit full healing.

**HEAT:** working in high temperatures is one of the leading causes of collapse and even death from heat stress in urban carriage horses. Such fatalities have occurred in New York, Boston, and Atlanta—and since such deaths are immediately concealed to avoid the inevitable bad publicity that results from such abuse, the statistics are based on underreporting of these collapses and fatalities. I am informed that Sacramento permits horses to work until the ambient air temperature (which is not recorded where the horses are actually working) exceeds 100 degrees Fahrenheit. This is unacceptably stressful on equines, especially those of the draft breeds who cannot dissipate heat from their body mass as efficiently as light horses. Whether Sacramento has high or average humidity, 100 degrees is not a humane working environment.

Please refer to the section in the attached article on New York's heat stress problems. You will note therein that the temperature as recorded by the US Weather Bureau is taken in a location that is much cooler than the microenvironment in which the horses work, which has been found to be as much as 45 degrees higher. For this reason, the temperature that the horses are experiencing should be recorded at the **height of their elbow**, which reflects the increased heat radiating up from the hot paved roadway surface. I recommend that the upper working limit in your city be set no higher than 90 degrees. This temperature maximum must be strictly enforced to make these horses' lives humane.

In addition, the horses should be offered the rest breaks as specified in your city's regulations, and they should be given access to shaded areas in which to rest so that they are not baking in the hot sunshine, which is hardly "restful" and presents a health risk rather than a respite from their working conditions. Any horse given an option between rest in the high heat versus under a cooler shaded structure will always choose relief from the punishing heat. Additionally, the harnesses should be at least loosened (removing them would be better) during their rest periods.

**SPOOKING:** please refer to the attached article. I understand that Sacramento has had additional incidents due to dogs attacking the carriage horses, which presents a very instinctive fear trigger to animals whose ancestors were killed by wild canids (wolves, coyotes.) I assume your animal control officials are assiduous in preventing such occurrences from happening again.

In reviewing your city's regulations regarding this tourist industry. It appears that they are not being enforced. I understand the budgetary restrictions that make inspecting the carriage horses a challenge, but since abuses are so common in this industry, constant surveillance is essential in order to make their working conditions **not only survivable but humane.**

I thank you for your attention in this matter, and offer my services if I can be of any assistance.

Sincerely,  
  
Holly Cheever, DVM  
Chairperson, Leadership Council of the Humane Society of the U.S.  
Vice president, New York State Humane Association  
Member, American Association of Equine Practitioners.

**Philadelphia Bar Institute: Animal Law Conference  
August 26, 2010**

**URBAN CARRIAGE HORSE RIDES:  
A 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY ANACHRONISM  
Holly Cheever, DVM**

To introduce myself, I am an equine veterinarian, educated at Harvard University and at the College of Veterinary Medicine at Cornell, with a lifetime of experience in horse management, including the driving of carriage horses. Since 1988, I have been the primary equine advisor for 2 states and, to date, 15 municipalities (including Philadelphia) that have sought knowledgeable assistance either to ban carriage horses from operating in their cities or to devise protective codes and legislation to prevent the all too common animal abuse that occurs in this industry. In particular, I was very involved with the campaign initiated by the American Society for the Protection of Animals and the New York-based Carriage Horse Action Committee between 1988 and 1996, calling for a ban of the use of carriage horses on New York City's streets, and have been an ongoing advisor for New York's Coalition to Ban Horse Drawn Carriages.

To begin with, I would like to state unequivocally that I don't believe that horse-drawn carriages and motor vehicles should share the same roadways due to the distressing history of injuries and deaths (both equine and human) that have occurred across the country due to carriage-car collisions. There is no way that cities with their exhaust fumes, hard road surfaces, and busy traffic patterns can provide a **humane** (as opposed to merely **survivable**) environment for a carriage horse. For that reason, I recommend that a ban against city carriage horse rides be implemented in each municipality, unless the horses can be restricted to a park or other area where they will not be competing with motor vehicles for road space and where their stabling can provide the essentials for comfortable, humane, and safe housing, including the provision of daily "turn-out". If a ban is not possible due to the tenacity of an entrenched tourist industry, then **detailed protective regulations and the ability to enforce them** are essential. In the case of New York, the only safe place for this tourist attraction would be to restrict them to Central Park, to which the Park Commissioner has expressed adamant opposition. I am not aware if there is any comparable area within the city limits of Philadelphia that could afford sufficient space for equine stabling and non-vehicular roadways for carriage rides.

In debating whether urban carriage horse rides as tourist attractions are a benign entertainment or an inherently abusive misuse of animals, we must examine all aspects of the horses' lives, care and use in the inherently inappropriate and hazardous (to horses) environment provided by busy city streets. Relevant aspects include the horses' source, training, stabling, proper management by their stable hands and drivers, availability of veterinary care, rest periods, and final disposition when they are no longer capable of pulling a carriage.

## **SOURCE**

The owner of a carriage horse operation adheres to the strict bottom line to achieve a maximum profit with a minimum of expenditure of time or resources. For this reason, the horses that are purchased for urban carriage rides are selected based on their prior experience in carriage pulling—the new owner has no interest in training a new horse to be proficient and reliable in an entirely new skill set and environment. Therefore, the horses selected and purchased at horse auctions (often from “killer sales”) are typically from one of two backgrounds: the draft breeds in the northeast come from Amish farms wherein they served as draft animals doing field work, while the smaller horses may also come from the Amish community where they were used for road work, and may also have come originally or immediately from the Standardbred tracks, where they raced as trotters or pacers pulling light sulkies (personal conversations with owners, 1988-92).

Due to their previous use, they require little additional training but may come into the urban carriage horse industry with preexisting injuries (lameness, arthritis, strained and bowed tendons, laminitis) and illnesses such as chronic obstructive pulmonary disease—COPD (“heaves” in equine terms). These preexisting conditions can have a significant impact on the horse’s well-being, suitability for and longevity in his/her new occupation.

## **HANDLING**

Based on my experience interviewing New York carriage drivers between 1988-1994, I found that a distressingly large percentage of drivers were not knowledgeable about horses and certainly had no prior experience as carriage drivers in a hazardous urban environment. Many were recent immigrants given employment through their American connections, becoming drivers with no equine background whatsoever. Thus, it is common to witness New York drivers chatting over their shoulders to their guests rather than keeping their attention strictly on the horse and his/her surroundings ahead. It is also common to see drivers who have no control over the horses’ heads due to their lack of a proper grip (if any) on the reins, and who even stand up in the driver’s box, which is forbidden in expert driving standards and competitions. In fact, expert carriage drivers who breed carriage horses and drive then as a vocation or for the love of their animals are not the ones who are involved in these urban carriage tourist trades. A topnotch breeder/driver would never subject their prized animals to these hostile and hazardous conditions, and such individuals are often most vocal against the urban tourist trade’s abuse.

Aside from the animals’ past injuries and present handling by inexperienced drivers, urban environments have inherent characteristics that make the safe handling and wholesome existence of carriage horses impossible. They are inescapably exposed to the following health hazards.

## **RESPIRATORY DISEASE**

Horses working in traffic lanes shared with motorized vehicles are constantly nose-to-tailpipe, whether waiting for their next fare by the curb or moving in the traffic lane. They show corresponding respiratory impairment, as was detailed in an unpublished study conducted by Dr.

Jeffie Roszel (personal communication, 1989). Dr. Roszel's study analyzed New York carriage horses' respiratory health in 1985 when they were still confined to Central Park; it showed that the horses suffered significant lung tissue damage and cellular changes due to their exposure to the noxious emission fumes of the vehicles—and this at a time when the horses were not out on the city streets, as they are now. For a horse with any preexisting respiratory impairment such as the common COPD or “heaves”, the congested atmosphere is a significant stressor to their health.

## LAMENESS

A lack of “soundness” is a major problem for horses who must pound the city streets' unnaturally hard, concussive surfaces for their long shifts. Many are not given adequate farrier care (i.e. hoof trimming and shoeing) and since many horses come into this industry with preexisting injuries or arthritis incurred in their previous uses on race tracks or Amish farms, their lack of soundness may become a growing problem. A horse's hoof is healthiest when left unshod and properly trimmed on a regular basis. The excessive pounding on the paved surfaces makes the use of shoes indispensable, and many horses do not get the frequent maintenance needed to keep their feet sound and healthy, especially if their hygiene in their stalls is inadequate and they develop infections (“thrush”) in addition.

## HEAT PROSTRATION

In the 1980's, death by heat stroke (hyperthermia) was a leading cause of death in the working carriage horse populations of New York, Atlanta, and Boston. Horses in harness on the hot streets, denied sufficient access to water and time in which to cool down, collapsed on the street and in their stables. For this reason, equine experts recommended that horses should be kept off the streets when the **combined temperature-humidity index (THI)**, which is the sum of the temperature in degrees Fahrenheit and the humidity in percentage points, exceeds 140; as the THI increases, so does the horses' risk for heat stress. One expert source states that a THI above 150 represents a serious threat to horses' health, especially if the humidity value is more than half of the combined sum (Mackay-Smith, M. and Cohen, M. 1982. *Exercise physiology and diseases of exertion*. In Mansmann, McAllister, and Pratt (eds.), *Equine Medicine and Surgery*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edition, Santa Barbara CA, I:125-129).

The issue of safe temperature ranges for the operation of carriage horses is typically the most contentious problem for city councils seeking consensus between their carriage horse industry and those citizens and agencies seeking to protect the animals. In the critical temperature range of 89 to 96 degrees Fahrenheit, a large horse, particularly one of the draft breeds, is greatly challenged in its ability to dissipate its body heat into an increasingly warm environment, especially if high humidity is a factor. A horse can lose 8-10 gallons of fluid with exercise in a hot environment, but if the air is saturated by high humidity, cooling by evaporation cannot occur—the atmosphere is too saturated to absorb more fluid, and the horse's core temperature continues to climb. If the horse becomes dehydrated and cannot produce sweat, anhydrosis (the lack of sweat production) ensues and can be life-threatening, but keeping a horse on an urban street well-hydrated can be a challenge in these modern days with no public horse troughs. The few public troughs that do exist (e.g. in New York) are prone to be polluted by trash and worse.

Since New York City's asphalt surfaces have reached temperatures of 200 degrees Fahrenheit as reported in the *New York Times* (7/9/89), keeping horses sufficiently cool on hot summer days in the humid northeast becomes impossible. To add to the challenge that the horses face, the U.S. Weather Bureau's cited temperature readings are significantly lower than the temperatures that the carriage horses' microenvironment (three to six feet off the pavement) provides. A study conducted by Cornell's Urban Horticultural Institute between 1983 and 1985 revealed that the temperature at street level in New York could be as much as 45 degrees F. higher than that recorded by the U.S. Weather Bureau (Bassuk, N. and Whitlow, T. 1988. Environmental stress in street trees. *Arbocultural Journal* 12:197-200). This makes it critically important that the ambient temperature must be taken at the horse's elbow height to determine when the animals should be returned to their stables, rather than relying on the temperature reported by the media.

Practically speaking, since Philadelphia has many days per annum in which the temperature/humidity is too high for horses' safety, a ban altogether is preferable to a burdensome system attempting to regulate when the horses must be removed from the streets.

## "SPOOKING"

As any knowledgeable horse person can tell you, the horse is an animal with a highly developed and highly effective flight drive when startled by an unexpected or threatening stimulus. Spooking can happen to even the best trained and well-mannered horse; their evolution as herbivores (i.e. prey animals) has conditioned them to bolt first and consider the situation later, dictating the need for the driver to be constantly in contact with the horse's head, whether by holding the reins securely from the carriage box or by standing at the horse's head with the reins in hand. The driver must also learn to anticipate potentially threatening stimuli in order to control the horse before it attempts to flee in panic, which is unlikely when the drivers are novices. I have heard carriage owners/drivers in several city council debates claim that their horses are "spook-proof"—there is no such thing.

The inevitable result of a horse being spooked while pulling a carriage in traffic is a tragic collision between the horse and the crossing vehicles at the next intersection that he/she gallops through in panic. People For the Ethical Treatment of Animals (PETA) maintains a data base of horse and carriage accidents available on their website ([www.peta.org](http://www.peta.org)) that are included in Appendix I; some accidents have resulted in both human and equine fatalities, and are much less likely to occur if the horses are restricted to areas with no motor vehicles in operation .

## STABLING

The essential provisions for appropriate stables for horses, often of draft breed size, whose daily shifts are spent between the extremely confining shafts of their carriages, are beyond the scope of this discussion. However, for a humane existence for the inhabitants, the stables must include: box stalls (not tie stalls) that are a minimum of ten by ten feet (twelve foot square is much better for the larger breeds); constant access to clean, potable water in each stall; good quality hay and grain secured in rodent- and moisture-proof containers; bedding that is

sufficiently absorbent and deep to provide comfort to the animal when resting; proper ventilation and cooling provided by fans to keep ammonia fumes to a minimum.

In addition, each horse should have—and rarely gets—daily turn-out in which he/she is given a period to relax with a compatible stable buddy in a large enclosure where they can roll, mutually groom one another, lie stretched out, and generally obtain relief from their arduous shifts and the discomfort of tight-fitting harness. In so doing, they satisfy both behavioral and physical needs. I am not aware of the current stabling available in Philadelphia: in 2000, when I inspected the three stables that housed this city’s carriage horses, two did provide such space and opportunity, which I have not seen in any other urban stabling situation.

During the several years that I inspected New York’s carriage horses on the street and in their stables at the request of the ASPCA and the Carriage Horse Action Committee, I found their housing and routine care to be a far cry from the precepts outlined above. I noted repeated violations of basic humane equine husbandry and care principles, as follows:

- The horses were not given adequate water during their work shifts since no public water was readily available to them, and most were denied the basic presence of water buckets in their stalls.
- Many horses were afforded inadequate hoof care and shoeing, adding to their likelihood of developing or exacerbating lameness.
- The stables were distressingly inadequate, with poor hygiene, temperature control, and ventilation. Also, most horses were confined to tie stalls rather than to box stalls, which meant that their entire lives as carriage horses kept them restricted to narrow spaces—between the carriage shafts while working and between their stall walls when resting, with never a chance to turn around comfortably or roll or scratch their itching hides after the harness was removed. Bedding was nonexistent or grossly inadequate.
- Many showed harness sores that should require them to be removed from work till healed; however, there was never sufficient enforcement of this regulation, and many horses worked with infected and inflamed sores.
- No opportunity for “turn-out” was provided since there was no room for such a space in the stable areas. Therefore, the horses had no opportunity to perform natural movements or experience normal socialization, so necessary for a herd animal, for their entire lives in this industry.

## **CONCLUSION**

Although carriage horse training and driving can be done with due attention to making the experience both humane and pleasurable for the horse in a proper setting, the tourist trades seen in urban settings cannot provide a safe and healthy environment as long as the horses must work in city streets where they are threatened by motor vehicle traffic and physically injurious environments. I hope that these tourist attractions are phased out in the near future, to be replaced (for example) by a nostalgic ride in a “green”, i.e. electric, antique model car. I ask animal advocates to work with their city councils and tourist boards to phase out this “quaint” form of equine abuse.

**Appendix I**

**From:** Working Animal Advocates [<mailto:workinganimaladvocates@gmail.com>]

**Sent:** Friday, January 31, 2014 2:03 PM

**To:** Rebecca Bitter

**Cc:** Steve Hansen; Leslie Wisniewski

**Subject:** Effects of Arena Construction & Downtown Development on Horse-Drawn Carriages

Dear Ms. Bitter,

We are writing today to express our concern with how the plans for development in downtown Sacramento, specifically with regard to the construction and use of the proposed Arena, will impact the horses used to pull carriages in and around the City's Old Town Historic District.

The horses are already adversely affected by traffic congestion, pollution and noise in and around Old Sacramento, and so we are concerned with how the anticipated increase in congestion, pollution and noise in the area as a result of the construction and use of the Arena will negatively impact them.

Are there any plans to eliminate some of the longer routes - such as the Capitol route that takes the carriages directly into urban traffic that is not anticipating the presence of horse-drawn carriages - in an effort to mitigate the negative impacts of high traffic volumes around the Arena? Or perhaps plans to prohibit the operation of horse-drawn carriages altogether during times of peak Arena use and activity?

Thank you for any information you can provide. We greatly hope the well-being and safety of the horses are being considered in the City's development plans.

Sincerely,

Kim Flaherty

Working Animal Advocates

<http://www.workinganimal.org/>